Comparative efficacy of fungicides for managing Ascochyta blight in chickpeas: PREMIX FUNGICIDES and OTHER MODES OF ACTION

A comprehensive review of 45 chickpea Ascochyta fungicide efficacy studies conducted across North Dakota from 2007 to 2019.

Collaborative research: Michael Wunsch & Blaine Schatz, NDSU Carrington Research Extension Center
Jeremy Pederson, NDSU North Central Research Extension Center
Audrey Kalil, Tyler Tjelde, & Gordy Bradbury, NDSU Williston Res. Extension Center

Compiled by: Michael Wunsch, plant pathologist NDSU Carrington Research Extension Center

Research funded by: Northern Pulse Growers Association
North Dakota Crop Protection Product Harmonization Board & Registration Board
BASF, DuPont, Arysta LifeScience, and Syngenta
Comparative efficacy of fungicides for managing Ascochyta blight in chickpeas:

3. SDHI + DMI PREMIX FUNGICIDES (FRAC 7 + 3)
   Including fungicides with primary FRAC 7 + 3 modes of action

**MIRAVIS TOP**: registered at 13.7 fl oz/ac
   active ingredients: pydiflumetofen (FRAC 7) + difenoconazole (FRAC 3)
   Efficacy at 13.7 fl oz/ac: **good to very good**

**REVYTEK**: registration anticipated in 2021 at 8.0 to 10.0 fl oz/ac
   active ingredients: fluxapyroxad (FRAC 7) + mefentrifluconazole (FRAC 3) + pyraclostrobin (FRAC 11)
   Efficacy at 8.0 fl oz/ac: **good to very good**    Efficacy at 10.0 fl oz/ac: **very good**

**APROVIA TOP**: registered at 10.5-11.0 fl oz/ac
   active ingredients: benzovindiflupyr (FRAC 7) + difenoconazole (FRAC 3)
   Not enough data to rigorously assess efficacy

**PROPULSE**: registered at 8.0 to 13.6 fl oz/ac
   active ingredient: fluopyram (FRAC 7) + prothioconazole (FRAC 3)
   Not enough data to rigorously assess efficacy
Across four studies conducted in Carrington and Hofflund (30 mile east of Williston) from 2017-2019, Miravis Top (13.6 fl oz) performed similarly or better than Proline (5.7 fl oz).

**LOW DISEASE PRESSURE**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2019 Hofflund CDC Frontier</th>
<th>2017 Carrington CDC Frontier</th>
<th>2018 Carrington CDC Frontier</th>
<th>2019 Carrington CDC Leader</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ASCOCHYTA 0-100 (AUDPC)</td>
<td>c 21 10 4</td>
<td>b 32 3 2</td>
<td>b 56 16 15</td>
<td>b 65 22 15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YIELD pounds/acre</td>
<td>c 391 1474 2438</td>
<td>b 1319 2424 2030</td>
<td>a 2015 2891 2838</td>
<td>a 336 2291 2051</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Fungicide efficacy, chickpea Ascochyta – SDHI + DMI (FRAC 7 + 3) premix fungicides:

**MIRAVIS TOP at 13.6 fl oz:** 30.6 grams pydiflumetofen (FRAC 7) + 50.5 g difenoconazole (FRAC 3)
Under low to moderate Ascochyta disease pressure, Revytek (8.0 or 10.0 fl oz) has performed similarly to Proline (5.7 fl oz).

Under high Ascochyta disease pressure, Revytek (8.0 or 10.0 fl oz) performed better than Proline (5.7 fl oz).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2017 Carrington CDC Frontier</th>
<th>2018 Carrington CDC Frontier</th>
<th>2019 Carrington CDC Frontier</th>
<th>2015 Carrington CDC Alma</th>
<th>2016 Carrington CDC Onon</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ascochyta yield (pounds/acre)</td>
<td>ascochyta yield (pounds/acre)</td>
<td>ascochyta yield (pounds/acre)</td>
<td>ascochyta yield (pounds/acre)</td>
<td>ascochyta yield (pounds/acre)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-treated</td>
<td>control</td>
<td>Proline 5.7 fl oz/ac</td>
<td>Revytek 8.0 fl oz/ac</td>
<td>Proline 8.0 fl oz/ac</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>b</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>a</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In limited testing conducted in 2017 and 2018 in Carrington, Aprovia Top (11.0 fl oz) was less effective than Proline (5.7 oz/ac) at managing Ascochyta foliar symptoms, but yield responses were similar.

Fungicide efficacy, chickpea Ascochyta – SDHI + DMI (FRAC 7 + 3) premix fungicides:

Aprovia Top, registered at 10.5 – 11.0 fl oz/ac

APROVIA TOP at 11.0 fl oz contains 25.3 g benzovindiflupyr (FRAC 7) + 40.5 g difenoconazole (FRAC 3)

In limited testing conducted in 2017 and 2018 in Carrington, Aprovia Top (11.0 fl oz) was less effective than Proline (5.7 oz/ac) at managing Ascochyta foliar symptoms, but yield responses were similar.
In limited testing conducted on a very susceptible chickpea variety, ProPulse (8.6 or 10.3 fl oz) did not perform as well as Proline (5.7 fl oz). ProPulse exhibited a rate response; will likely perform better at 13.6 fl oz/ac.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ascochyta severity 0 to 100</td>
<td>Chickpea yield pounds/acre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-treated</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proline 5.7 fl oz/ac</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3820</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ProPulse 8.6 fl oz/ac</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1958</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ProPulse 10.3 fl oz/ac</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2546</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CV: 8.0 for 6.0 fl oz, 13.0 for 8.6 fl oz, 12.0 for 10.3 fl oz, 11.4 for 13.6 fl oz.
Comparative efficacy of fungicides for managing Ascochyta blight in chickpeas:

4. OTHER FUNGICIDE MODES OF ACTION
Active ingredients in FRAC groups 9, 12, 29, and M5

**OMEGA**: registered at 8.0 to 13.6 fl oz/ac
  - active ingredients: fluazinam (FRAC 29)
  - Efficacy at 13.0-14.0 fl oz/ac: **fair**

**SWITCH**: registered at 11.0 to 14.0 fl oz/ac
  - active ingredients: cyprodinil (FRAC 9) + fludioxonil (FRAC 12)
  - No efficacy data available.

**BRAVO WEATHER STIK**: registered at 1.38 to 2.0 pt/ac
  - active ingredient: chlorothalonil (FRAC M5)
  - Efficacy at 1.38 pt/ac: **fair**

**BRAVO WEATHER STIK** (1.38 pt/ac) + **PROLINE** (5.0 or 5.7 fl oz/ac):
  - active ingredients: chlorothalonil (FRAC M5) + prothioconazole (FRAC 3)
  - Efficacy, Bravo WS (1.38 pt) + Proline (5.0 or 5.7 fl oz): **excellent**

**SWITCH**: registered at 11.0 to 14.0 fl oz/ac
  - active ingredient: cyprodinil (FRAC 9) + fludioxonil (FRAC 12)
  - No efficacy data available.
At low to moderate Ascochyta pressure: Omega (13.6 fl oz/ac) was slightly less effective than Proline (5.7 fl oz/ac).

Under high Ascochyta pressure: Omega (13.6 or 14.0 fl oz/ac) was less effective than Proline (5.7 fl oz/ac)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LOW DISEASE PRESSURE</th>
<th>2012 Carrington CDC Frontier</th>
<th>2012 Hofflund CDC Frontier</th>
<th>2013 Hofflund CDC Frontier</th>
<th>2015 Sykeston CDC Alma</th>
<th>2015 Sykeston CDC Frontier</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ASCOCHYTA 0-100 (AUDPC)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YIELD pounds/acre</td>
<td>3449</td>
<td>1835</td>
<td>1448</td>
<td>1077</td>
<td>1074</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HIGH DISEASE PRESSURE</th>
<th>2015 Sykeston CDC Alma</th>
<th>2015 Sykeston CDC Frontier</th>
<th>2018 Carrington CDC Frontier</th>
<th>2015 Sykeston Sierra</th>
<th>2016 Sykeston Sierra</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ASCOCHYTA 0-100 (AUDPC)</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YIELD pounds/acre</td>
<td>1144</td>
<td>1099</td>
<td>1345</td>
<td>663</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

OMEGA at 8.0 fl oz contains 118.2 grams fluazinam (FRAC 29)
OMEGA at 13.6 fl oz contains 201.0 grams fluazinam (FRAC 29)
Across all studies in which Omega (13.6-14.0 fl oz) and Proline (5.7 fl oz) were evaluated:

- Omega (13.6-14.0 fl oz/ac) was overwhelmed by Ascochyta at lower levels of disease pressure than Proline (5.7 fl oz/ac)

Blue dots: Each dot corresponds to the performance of the fungicide in one field trial.

**Fungicide efficacy, chickpea Ascochyta – FRAC 29 fungicide:**

**Omega, registered at 8.0 to 13.6 fl oz/ac**

OMEGA at 8.0 fl oz contains 118.2 grams fluazinam (FRAC 29)

OMEGA at 13.6 fl oz contains 201.0 grams fluazinam (FRAC 29)

**Omega 13.7-14.0 fl oz/ac**

active ingredient = fluazinam (500 g a.i./liter)

Maximum = 41.7

**Proline 5.7 fl oz/ac**

active ingredient = prothioconazole (480 g a.i./liter)

Maximum = 50.1

Ascochyta disease pressure

Ascochyta severity (0-100; rAUDPC) in the non-treated control
Across five studies conducted in Carrington and Hofflund (30 miles east of Williston), Bravo WeatherStik or Echo 720 (1.38 pt/ac) was less effective than Proline (5.7 fl oz/ac) except under low disease pressure.

### Fungicide efficacy, chickpea Ascochyta – FRAC M5 fungicides:

**Bravo WeatherStik**, registered at 1.38 to 2.0 pt/ac

**BRAVO WEATHER STIK** at 1.38 pints contains 469.5 grams chlorothalonil (FRAC M5). Many brands of chlorothalonil are available, and testing was also conducted with Echo 720.

### LOW DISEASE PRESSURE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2019 Hofflund CDC Frontier</th>
<th>2019 Carrington CDC Frontier</th>
<th>2019 Carrington Sierra</th>
<th>2019 Carrington CDC Leader</th>
<th>2019 Carrington CDC Leader</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>YIELD</td>
<td>391</td>
<td>1474</td>
<td>1668</td>
<td>259</td>
<td>1691</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASCOCHYTA 0-100 (AUDPC)</td>
<td>b a a a</td>
<td>b a a a</td>
<td>b a a a</td>
<td>b a a a</td>
<td>b a a a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>21</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>60</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>Not tested</td>
<td>Not tested</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5.7 fl oz/ac</td>
<td>1.38 pt/ac</td>
<td>1.38 pt/ac</td>
<td>5.7 fl oz/ac</td>
<td>1.38 pt/ac</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### HIGH DISEASE PRESSURE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2019 Hofflund CDC Frontier</th>
<th>2019 Carrington CDC Frontier</th>
<th>2019 Carrington Sierra</th>
<th>2019 Carrington CDC Leader</th>
<th>2019 Carrington CDC Leader</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>YIELD</td>
<td>336</td>
<td>2291</td>
<td>1185</td>
<td>1186</td>
<td>1186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASCOCHYTA 0-100 (AUDPC)</td>
<td>c a b a</td>
<td>c a b a</td>
<td>c a b a</td>
<td>c a b a</td>
<td>c a b a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>65</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>216</td>
<td>Not tested</td>
<td>1210</td>
<td>Not tested</td>
<td>Not tested</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>445</td>
<td>1.38 pt/ac</td>
<td>1.38 pt/ac</td>
<td>5.7 fl oz/ac</td>
<td>1.38 pt/ac</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Note: Treatments with different letters within the same column indicate statistically significant differences.*
Across all studies in which Bravo Weather Stik or Echo 720 (1.38 pt) and Proline (5.7 fl oz) were evaluated:

- Bravo Weather Stik / Echo 720 was overwhelmed by Ascochyta at lower levels of disease pressure than Proline (5.7 fl oz/ac)

Blue dots: Each dot corresponds to the performance of the fungicide in one field trial.

**IMPACT OF FUNGICIDE ON YIELD:**

**Bravo WS / Echo 720** 1.38 pt/ac  
active ingredient = chlorothalonil (719 g a.i./liter)

\[ y = -0.9856x^2 + 75.098x \]  

\[ R^2 = 0.0035 \]

Maximum = 38.1

**IMPACT OF FUNGICIDE ON CHICKPEA YIELD:**

**Proline** 5.7 fl oz/ac  
active ingredient = prothioconazole (480 g a.i./liter)

\[ y = -0.6531x^2 + 65.406x \]  

\[ R^2 = 0.3408 \]

Maximum = 50.1
Fungicide efficacy, chickpea Ascochyta FRAC M5 fungicide:

**Bravo WeatherStik**
(1.38 pt/ac) tank-mixed with **Proline**
(5.0 or 5.7 fl oz/ac)

Bravo Weather Stik is most effective as a tank-mix partner with other fungicides.

Across 11 studies conducted over 4 years, Tank-mixing Bravo WeatherStik (1.38 pt/ac) and Proline (5.0 or 5.7 fl oz/ac) consistently improved Ascochyta management relative to Proline applied alone.

Gains in disease control and yield were observed at low, moderate and high Ascochyta disease pressure.
Bravo Weather Stik is most effective as a tank-mix partner with other fungicides.

Across 11 studies conducted over 4 years, tank-mixing Bravo Weather Stik (1.38 pt/ac) and Proline (5.0 or 5.7 fl oz/ac) consistently improved Ascochyta management relative to Proline applied alone.

Gains in disease control and yield were observed at low, moderate and high Ascochyta disease pressure.
Bravo WeatherStik is most effective as a tank-mix partner with other fungicides.

**Fungicide efficacy, chickpea Ascochyta - FRAC M5 fungicide:**

**Bravo WeatherStik** (1.38 or 2.0 pt/ac) tank-mixed with **Proline** (5.0 or 5.7 fl oz/ac)

Preliminary data from a study conducted in Carrington in 2019:

Increasing the application rate of Bravo WeatherStik from 1.38 pt/ac to 2.0 pt/ac may increase the efficacy of tank-mixes with Proline.

---

**Optimizing application rates:**

**Bravo WeatherStik, Proline tank-mix**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2019</th>
<th>Carrington</th>
<th>‘CDC Frontier’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**ASCOCYHTA**

rAUDPC 0-100

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>d</th>
<th>c</th>
<th>b</th>
<th>b</th>
<th>b</th>
<th>a</th>
<th>a</th>
<th>a</th>
<th>a</th>
<th>a</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2019</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**YIELD**

13.5% moisture pounds/acre

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2019</th>
<th>Non-treated control</th>
<th>Bravo WS 22 fl oz/ac</th>
<th>Bravo WS 32 fl oz/ac</th>
<th>Proline 5.0 fl oz/ac</th>
<th>Proline 5.7 fl oz/ac</th>
<th>Proline 5.0 fl oz/ac + Bravo WS 22 fl oz/ac</th>
<th>Proline 5.0 fl oz/ac + Bravo WS 32 fl oz/ac</th>
<th>Proline 5.0 fl oz/ac + Proline 5.7 fl oz/ac</th>
<th>Proline 5.0 fl oz/ac + Proline 5.0 fl oz/ac + Bravo WS 22 fl oz/ac</th>
<th>Proline 5.0 fl oz/ac + Proline 5.0 fl oz/ac + Bravo WS 32 fl oz/ac</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2019</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>445</td>
<td>705</td>
<td>1127</td>
<td>1089</td>
<td>1606</td>
<td>1893</td>
<td>2167</td>
<td>2269</td>
<td>2269</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Across all studies in which Proline (5.0-5.7 fl oz) + Bravo WS (1.38 pt) and Proline (5.7 fl oz) were evaluated:

- At very high Ascochyta pressure, the yield gains from the tank-mix also declined just as with Proline applied alone, but average yield gains at any given level of disease pressure were higher with the tank-mix.

Blue dots: Each dot corresponds to the performance of the fungicide in one field trial.
Fungicide application timing:

- The first application was made at the first appearance of Ascochyta symptoms (one or two small lesions on a low percentage of plants).
  - In dry years, this typically has corresponded to early bloom.
  - In wet years, this typically has corresponded to late vegetative growth.

- Subsequent applications were made 10-14 days apart until chickpeas began to senesce except when there is an extended stretch of dry weather, in which case an application is delayed until shortly before forecasted rain.
  - In most years, this corresponds to 3 to 5 applications.
Fungicide application methods:
- Spray volume: 15 or 17.5 gal/ac.
- Droplet size: fine or medium
- Nozzles, pressure: TeeJet extended-range flat-fan nozzles, 30 to 40 psi

Fungicide rotation: Rotating fungicide modes of action
- Rotating fungicide modes of action is critical for maintaining the effectiveness of fungicides. It also improves disease control.
- When conducting fungicide efficacy testing in chickpeas, the same fungicide is applied sequentially in order to ensure that every fungicide is exposed to the same conditions all season.
- The fungicide efficacy results are meant to be used as tools for choosing appropriate fungicides when developing fungicide rotation strategies.
The comparative performance of fungicides sometimes differs across studies.

Fungicides differ in residual activity – how long a fungicide confers satisfactory disease control after being applied.
- When disease pressure occurs primarily shortly after fungicides are applied, both long and short-residual fungicides perform well.
- When disease onset is late, only long-residual fungicides perform well.

Fungicides differ in the level of disease pressure that can be successfully controlled by the fungicide.
- Under low to moderate disease pressure, many fungicides may perform well.
- Under high disease pressure, only the most effective fungicides perform well.
Thank you!

Research funded by:
Northern Pulse Growers Association
North Dakota Crop Protection Product Harmonization Board & Registration Board
BASF, DuPont, Arysta LifeScience, and Syngenta